

Music Intervention for Individuals With Schizophrenia: Systematic Review

Young Shil Kim

1. Description of the Poster

The purpose of this study was to systematically review music intervention studies for individuals with schizophrenia. Music interventions for individuals with schizophrenia are mediated in several clinical fields such as music therapy, psychiatry, nursing etc. Effect of music interventions with individuals with schizophrenia are quantitatively reviewed through some studies. However, in each study music interventions have different contents in detail. To analyze music intervention, the reviewer searched nine electronic databases such as PubMed, EBSCOhost, PsycInfo, ProQuest, Scopus, Wiley Online Library, Cochrane Library, CINAHL for clinical trials published since 2000, using combinations of keywords related to schizophrenia and music interventions; "Schizophrenia", "Music", "Intervention", "therapy", "Schizophreni*", "music*", "therapeutic*" and activities type; "music listening", "music playing", "improvisation", "singing". The initial search identified 283 studies, and fifteen studies were selected by reviewing the titles, abstracts and full articles, In addition, three articles were added by examining other review articles. Thus, a total of 19 articles were analyzed in terms of their general (design, setting, participants information, measurements, major outcomes) and intervention characteristics (therapist, session information, activities type, characteristics of music), and the PEDro scale which are check list used for quality assessment of clinical researches was used to evaluate the methodological quality of the included studies. The results demonstrated that, due to the lack of randomization and blinding, the methodological qualities of the studies with high quality music interventions were often rated low. Common clinical features of the 8 trials that implemented music interventions provided by qualified music therapists included: inclusion of creative and active music making; emphasis on the reciprocal relationships between client-music-therapist; and clinical supervision for ensuring the quality of therapeutic interventions. In conclusion, this review study suggests the implementation of randomization and blinding, and inclusion of detailed descriptions for intervention procedures with clear rationale, in order to improve the methodological and intervention quality of the clinical trials for patients with schizophrenia.

2. Abstract

In this systematic review on music intervention studies for individuals with schizophrenia, analysis of the selected 19 studies have been done concentrated on general analysis and music interventions. With quality evaluation of selected studies, the results demonstrated that, even music interventions with high quality were often underestimated due to the lack of the methodological quality of the studies.

3. Keywords

systematic review, schizophrenia, music therapy, music intervention, quality evaluation

4. Biography of the Presenter

- Name: **Young Shil Kim**

- Ph. D. Candidate of Ewha Womans University, Department of Music Therapy
- Instructor and supervisor of Ewha Womans University, Department of Music Therapy
- Korean Certified Music Therapist (KCMT)
- Music and Imagery Therapist (MIT)
- Trainee of GIM level 3
- Researcher of Ewha Music Wellness Center
- Email address: mtherapy4u@gmail.com

References

- Abrams, B. (2010). Evidence-based music therapy practice: An integral understanding. *Journal of Music Therapy, 47*(4), 351-379.
- American Psychiatric Association. (2013). *Diagnostic and statistical manual of mental disorders, (DSM-5®)*. Arlington, Va: American Psychiatric Pub.
- Ansdell G. (2002). Community music therapy and the winds of change. *Voice 2*(2).
- Antman, E. M., Lau, J., Kupelnick, B., Mosteller, F., & Chalmers, T. C. (1992). A comparison of results of meta-analyses of randomized control trials and recommendations of clinical experts: Treatments for myocardial infarction. *Journal of American Medical Association, 268*(2), 240-248.
- * Bloch, B., Reshef, A., Vadas, L., Haliba, Y., Ziv, N., Kremer, I., & Haimov, I. (2010). The effects of music relaxation on sleep quality and emotional measures in people living with schizophrenia. *Journal of Music Therapy, 47*(1), 27-52.
- Bradt, J., Dileo, C., & Shim, M. (2013). Music interventions for preoperative anxiety. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews, 2013*(6), doi: 10.1002/14651858.CD006908.pub2
- Bruscia, K. E. (1998). *Defining music therapy*. 2nd ed. Gilsum, NH: Barcelona Publishers.
- Bruscia, K. E. (2014). *Defining music therapy*. 3rd ed. Gilsum, NH: Barcelona Publishers.
- * Ceccato, E., Caneva, P., & Lamonaca, D. (2006). Music therapy and cognitive rehabilitation in schizophrenic patients: A controlled study. *Nordic Journal of Music Therapy, 15*(2), 110-120.
- Chan, M. F., Wong, Z. Y., & Thayala, N. V. (2011). The effectiveness of music listening in reducing depressive symptoms in adults: A systematic review. *Complementary Therapies in Medicine, 19*(6), 332-348.
- Cho, H. A. (2013). Analysis of music therapy research in professional journals in Korea. *Journal of Music and Human Behavior, 10*(2), 55-77.
- Chong, H. J. (2015). *Music therapy: Understanding and application*. Seoul: Ewha Womans University Press.
- Crawford-Walker, C. J., King, A., & Chan, S. (2005). Distraction techniques for schizophrenia. *Cochrane Database of systematic Reviews, 2005*(1), doi: 10.1002/14651858.CD004717.pub2
- * de l'Etoile, S. K. (2002). The effectiveness of music therapy in group psychotherapy for adults with mental illness. *The Arts in Psychotherapy, 29*(2), 69-78.
- Davis, W., & Hadley, S. (2015). A history of music therapy. In Wheeler, B. (Ed.), *Music therapy handbook*, 17-28. New York; London: The Guilford Press.
- Davis, W. B., Gfeller, K. E., & Thaut, M. H. (2008). *An introduction to music therapy: Theory and practice*. American Music Therapy Association. 8455 Colesville Road Suite 1000, Silver Spring, MD 20910.
- * De Sousa, A., & De Sousa, J. (2010). Music therapy in chronic schizophrenia. *Journal of Pakistan Psychiatric Society, 7*(1), 13-17.
- Elestien, A. S. (2004). On the origins and development of evidence-based medicine and medical decision making. *Inflammation Research, 53*, S184-189.

- Jeong, G. S., & Kim, M. H. (2015). Effect of music therapy on anxiety, blood pressure, heart rate and glucose levels of patients undergoing surgery during spinal anesthesia. *The Journal of Fundamentals of Nursing*, 22(1), 25-34.
- Gold, C., Haldal, T. O., Dahle, T., & Wigram, T. (2005). Music therapy for schizophrenia or schizophrenia-like illnesses. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews*. 2011(12), doi: 10.1002/14651858.CD004025.pub3
- * Gold, C., Mössler, K., Grocke, D., Haldal, T. O., Tjemsland, L., Aarre, T., ... Rolvsjord, R. (2013). Individual music therapy for mental health care clients with low therapy motivation: Multicentre randomised controlled trial. *Psychotherapy and Psychosomatics*, 82(5), 319-331.
- * Hayashi, N., Tanabe, Y., Nakagawa, S., Noguchi, M., Iwata, C., Koubuchi, Y., ... Koike, I. (2002). Effects of group musical therapy on inpatients with chronic psychoses: A controlled study. *Psychiatry and Clinical Neurosciences*, 56(2), 187-193.
- Hillecke, T., Nickel, A., & Bolay, H. V. (2005). Scientific perspectives on music therapy. *Annals of the New York Academy of Sciences*, 1060(1), 271-282.
- Jeong, G. S., & Kim, M. H. (2015). Effect of music therapy on anxiety, blood pressure, heart rate and glucose levels of patients undergoing surgery during spinal anesthesia. *Journal of Korean Academy of Fundamentals of Nursing*, 22(1), 25-34.
- Jorm, A. F., Morgan, A. J., & Hetrick, S. E. (2008). Relaxation for depression. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews*. 2008(4), doi: 10.1002/14651858.CD007142.pub2
- Jung, N. T., & Newton, R. (2009). Cochrane Reviews of non-medication-based psychotherapeutic and other interventions for schizophrenia, psychosis, and bipolar disorder: A systematic literature review. *International Journal of Mental Health Nursing*, 18(4), 239-249.
- Kim, S. Y., Park, J. E., Seo, H. J., Lee, Y. J., Jang, B. H., Son, H. J., ... Shin, C. M. (2011). NECA's guidance for undertaking systematic reviews and meta-analyses for intervention. Seoul: National Evidence-based Healthcare Collaborating Agency.
- Kong, E. H., & Park, M. H. (2015). Effects of music therapy on agitation in dementia: Systematic review and meta-analysis. *Korean Journal of Adult Nursing*, 27(1), 106-116.
- * Kwon, M., Gang, M., & Oh, K. (2013). Effect of the group music therapy on brain wave, behavior, and cognitive function among patients with chronic Schizophrenia. *Asian Nursing Research*, 7(4), 168-174.
- * Lee, H. J., Lee, D. B., Park, M. C., & Lee, S. Y. (2014). The effect of group music therapy on the social function and interpersonal relationship in outpatients with schizophrenia. *Journal of Korean Neuropsychiatric Association*, 53(1), 40-53.
- Lee, J. H. (2013). Music for pediatric patients in medical settings: A systematic Review of randomized controlled trials. *Journal of Music and Human Behavior*, 10(2), 1-33.
- * Lu, S. F., Lo, C. H. K., Sung, H. C., Hsieh, T. C., Yu, S. C., & Chang, S. C. (2013). Effects of group music intervention on psychiatric symptoms and depression in patient with schizophrenia. *Complementary Therapies in Medicine*, 21(6), 682-688.
- Maratos, A., Gold, C., Wang, N., & Crawford, M. (2008). Music therapy for depression. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews*. 2008(1), doi:

- * Moe, T., Roesen, A., & Raben, H. (2000). Restitutional factors in group music therapy with psychiatric patients based on a modification of guided imagery and music (GIM). *Nordic Journal of Music Therapy*, 9(2), 36-50.
- * Morgan, K., Bartrop, R., Telfer, J., & Tennant, C. (2011). A controlled trial investigating the effect of music therapy during an acute psychotic episode. *Acta Psychiatrica Scandinavica*, 124(5), 363-371.
- Mössler, K., Chen, N., Heldal, T. O., & Gold, C. (2011). Music therapy for people with schizophrenia and schizophrenia-like disorders. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews*. 2011(12), doi: 10.1002/14651858.CD004025.pub3
- PEDro Scale (1999). <http://www.pedro.org.au/english/downloads/pedro-scale/>
- * Peng, S. M., Koo, M., & Kuo, J. C. (2010). Effect of group music activity as an adjunctive therapy on psychotic symptoms in patients with acute schizophrenia. *Archives of Psychiatric Nursing*, 24(6), 429-434.
- Sackett, D. L. (2000). *Evidence-based medicine*. John Wiley & Sons. Ltd.
- * Silverman, M. J. (2011). Effects of music therapy on psychiatric patients' proactive coping skills: Two pilot studies. *The Arts in Psychotherapy*, 38(2), 125-129.
- * Silverman, M. J. (2013a). Effects of group songwriting on depression and quality of life in acute psychiatric inpatients: A randomized three group effectiveness study. *Nordic Journal of Music Therapy*, 22(2), 131-148.
- * Silverman, M. J. (2013b). Effects of music therapy on self-and experienced stigma in patients on an acute care psychiatric unit: A randomized three group effectiveness study. *Archives of Psychiatric Nursing*, 27(5), 223-230.
- * Talwar, N., Crawford, M. J., Maratos, A., Nur, U., McDERMOTT, O. R. I. I., & Procter, S. (2006). Music therapy for in-patients with schizophrenia. Exploratory randomised controlled trial. *The British Journal of Psychiatry*, 189(5), 405-409.
- Thaut, M. H. (1999). A session structure for music psychotherapy. In w. B. Davis, K. E. Gfeller, & M. H. Thaut (Eds.), *An introduction to music therapy; Theory and practice* (2nd ed.). New York: McGraw Hill.
- * Ulrich, G., Houtmans, T., & Gold, C. (2007). The additional therapeutic effect of group music therapy for schizophrenic patients: A randomized study. *Acta Psychiatrica Scandinavica*, 116(5), 362-370.
- Vink, A., & Bruinsma, M. (2014). Evidence based music therapy. In *Dialogue and Debate-Conference Proceedings of the 10th World Congress on Music Therapy* (p. 1779-1806).
- World Health Organization (2015). What is schizophrenia?. Retrieved from http://www.who.int/mental_health/management/schizophrenia/en/
- Yinger, O. S., & Gooding, L. F. (2015). A systematic review of music-based interventions for Procedural Support. *Journal of Music Therapy*, 52(1), 1-77.
- * Zincir, S. B., Zincir, S., Yenel, A., Kivilcim, Y., Cetin, B., Tulay, C., & Basar, U. (2014). Classical Turkish music as group music therapy for inpatients with schizophrenia: Feasibility and efficacy. *International Journal*, 2(4), 1063-1072.

Notes * indicates studies reviewed in this paper

Bibliography of Excluded Articles

- Ansdell, G., & Meehan, J. (2010). "Some light at the end of the tunnel". Exploring users' evidence for the effectiveness of music therapy in adult mental health settings. *Music and Medicine*, 2(1), 29-40.
- Troice, E. M., & Sosa, J. J. S. (2003). The musical experience as a curative factor in music therapy with patients with chronic schizophrenia. *Salud Mental*, 26(4), 47-58.
- Næss, T., & Ruud, E. (2007). Audible gestures: From clinical improvisation to community music therapy: Music therapy with an institutionalized woman diagnosed with paranoid schizophrenia. *Nordic Journal of Music Therapy*, 16(2), 160-171.